FIGURE 1

Sample row of the rubric.

	Novice	Emerging	Proficient	Advanced
Claim *An explanation or conclusion that answers a research question*	*Instructional Context:* With classroom supports and modeling... Context, problem, and solutions are all provided, sentence starters or cloze statements...	*Instructional Context:* When presented in isolation... Specific problems are identified, objects / events are given...	*Instructional Context:* When presented in paragraph form... Specific problems are identified, objects / events are given...	*Instructional Context:* When presented in paragraph or auditory form. A general area of focus is provided, students are able to identify problems with teacher guidance...
Constructing	Student can comment on an object, tool, or solution they are presented with.	Given a problem, object or event, student can state both a fact and an opinion. Student can provide a claim about an identified problem.	Student will be able to make a claim about "the effectiveness of an object, tool, or solution that is supported by evidence." Student will develop a claim that is related to problem.	Student can make a claim about a problem, object or event and provide at least two substantiating data points.
Warrant/ Justification *The justification of using the evidence to support the claim, including how the two ideas are **linked**, this encompasses the understanding of relevancy.*	*Instructional Context:* With text at student level, and limited options... Given text and relevant vocabulary choices....￼	*Instructional Context:* When presented in isolation... Specific problems are identified, objects / events are given, vocabulary lists are available...	*Instructional Context:* When presented in paragraph form... Specific problems are identified, objects / events are given...	*Instructional Context:* When presented in paragraph or auditory form. A general area of focus is provided, student is able to identify problems with teacher guidance...
Identifying / Critiquing	Student can identify evidence that does not belong in a set. Student can identify justification vocabulary in a sentence.	Student can identify a statement that is used to justify the use of data to support a claim.	Student can rank provided justifications from strongest to weakest. Student actively listens to peers sharing justifications about claims.	Student can differentiate between a strong / weak justification and can verbally explain why data are not relevant to a claim.